



# City of Santa Barbara

## HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

### MINUTES

#### MARCH 1, 2023

1:30 P.M.  
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room  
630 Garden Street  
[SantaBarbaraCA.gov](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov)

#### COMMISSION MEMBERS:

Anthony Grumbine, *Chair*  
Steve Hausz, *Vice Chair*  
Keith Butler  
Dennis Doordan  
Michael Drury  
Cass Ensberg  
Ed Lenvik  
Charles McClure  
Robert Ooley

**ADVISORY MEMBER:** Dr. Michael Glassow

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:** Kristen Sneddon

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:** Sheila Lodge

#### STAFF:

Tava Ostrenger, Assistant City Attorney  
Ellen Kokinda, Design Review Supervisor  
Nicole Hernandez, Architectural Historian  
Barbara Burkhart, Assistant Planner  
Kira Esparza, Commission Secretary

---

### CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Grumbine.

### ATTENDANCE

Commissioners present: Grumbine, Hausz, Butler, Doordan, Drury, Ensberg, Lenvik, Ooley, and McClure

Commissioners absent: None

Staff present: Kokinda (from 2:05 p.m.- 2:54 p.m.); Rosie Dyste, Project Planner (until 2:54 p.m.); Kathy Kennedy, Project Planner (2:54 p.m.- 6:00 p.m.); Hernandez; Burkhart; Heidi Reidel, Assistant Planner; and Esparza

### GENERAL BUSINESS

#### A. Public Comment:

Written correspondence from Isabella Madarang, Jackie Berlado, and Jackie Beraldo was acknowledged.

No public comment.

#### B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **February 1, 2023**, and **February 15, 2023**, as submitted

Action: Drury/Ooley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

#### C. Approval of the Consent Calendar:

- Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **March 1, 2023**, as reviewed by Commissioners Hausz and McClure  
Action: Drury/Ooley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:
1. Ms. Burkhart announced that Heidi Reidel will be the new staff liaison for HLC.
  2. Commissioner Ooley announced that he would like to present to Chair Grumbine a historic gavel.
  3. Commissioner Doordan announced that City Council voted on the designation of the State St. Parkway as a historic landmark and commended Nicole Hernandez, City Architectural Historian for her presentation to Council.
- E. Subcommittee Reports:
- No subcommittee reports.

### **(1:45PM) DISCUSSION ITEM**

#### **1. DRAFT OBJECTIVE DESIGN AND DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS**

Reference Number: PLN2023-00015

Staff: Rosie Dyste; City of Santa Barbara, Project Planner

(Request for specific input on the Administrative Draft Objective Design and Development Standards. The Administrative Draft was prepared by Opticos Design Inc. Staff, the public, and a Work Group comprised of members from the Historic Landmarks Commission, Architectural Board of Review, Planning Commission, and American Institute of Architects are currently reviewing the document as well. The Commission's input will be relayed to Opticos Design for consideration in the revised draft.)

#### **[DRAFT Objective Design and Development Standards\\*](#)**

#### **[Objective Designs Standards Staff Report\\*](#)**

*\*Available for view online at [SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC)*

Actual time: 1:40 p.m.

Present: Rosie Dyste, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 1:54 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rick Closson
2. Patricia Saley
3. Rich Untermann

Written correspondence from Rick Closson, Patricia Saley, Fred Sweeney, and American Institute of Architects was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 2:02 p.m.

**Discussion held.**

**(2:15PM) CONTINUED ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**

**2. 20 E DE LA GUERRA ST (De La Guerra Plaza)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-092-037

Zone: C-G/P-R

Application Number: PLN2019-00576

Owner: City of Santa Barbara

Applicant: Brad Hess; Public Works, Principal Project Manager

(Listed on the City's Historic Resource Inventory and located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District. The De La Guerra Plaza Revitalization Project proposes to raise the entire Plaza, as well as De La Guerra Street between Anacapa Street and State Street, to be level with the existing sidewalk and install new landscaping, water feature, restrooms, pavilion, stage, art nodes, lighting, and trash/ recycling. The 2011 Historic Structures/Sites Report accepted by the HLC found that De La Guerra Plaza is eligible for designation as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark, listing in the California Register of Historical Resources, and the National Register of Historic Places. Surrounding De La Guerra Plaza are City Hall and the California Pepper Tree, The News Press Building, Casa De La Guerra, and El Paseo, all designated City Landmarks; and the La Placita Building a.k.a. McKay-Bothin Building that is a designated Structure of Merit.)

**No final appealable action will be taken at this meeting. The project was last reviewed on April 22, 2022.**

**2011 Historic Structures/Sites Report\***

*\*Available for view online at [SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC)*

Actual time: 2:54 p.m.

Present: Brad Hess, Project Manager, City of Santa Barbara; Leif McKay, Landscape Architect, RRM Design Group; Elijah Pearce, Architect, RRM Design Group; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:22 p.m.,

The following individuals spoke:

1. Rich Untermann
2. Rosanne Crawford
3. Paulina Conn

Written correspondence from Mark Schneidman, Paulina Conn, Francesca Galt, Pamela Boehr, Rich Untermann, Darcy and William Sylvester, David Brandt, Liz Bustamonte, Jason Dominguez, Nik Shiffman, Scot Wenz, and Marrel Brooks was acknowledged.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely with the following comments:**

1. Most Commissioners believe the pavilion is going in the right direction, but the applicant should simplify the design so it reads as an accessory, backdrop building.
2. Study historic 1920's plaza paving patterns to incorporate into the design. The pattern(s) should be shown on a colored landscape plan.
3. Some Commissioners suggested using landscaping to screen the parking lot instead of the pavilion.
4. Some Commissioners do not like the bubbler feature, while some do not like the location of the bubbler. The Commission was previously open to the bubbler as a general feature but are looking for further design improvements of the feature.
5. Most Commissioners favor the overall organization of Design Concept B for the main entrance design. Consider using a simple archway entry as a possible solution to the signage issue. There may be a requirement to include ADA access, and if so, provide further design illustrating that feature.
6. Use a darker color of paving to distinguish the parking and vehicle area.
7. Study moving the restroom to the pavilion building. The Commission was previously supportive of the restroom location.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 6/2/1. (McClure abstained.) Motion carried.

Individual comments: Commissioners Lenvik and Ensberg stated that they believe the project is going in the wrong direction.

**\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 4:48 TO 5:02 P.M. \***

**(3:15PM) NEW ITEM: CONCEPT REVIEW**

3. **3237 STATE ST**
- |                           |                                                                                                        |
|---------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Assessor's Parcel Number: | 051-112-019                                                                                            |
| Zone:                     | RS-7.5/USS                                                                                             |
| Application Number:       | PLN2022-00104                                                                                          |
| Owner:                    | United States Indian Health Service;<br>Kevin J. D'Amanda, Director, Division of Facilities Operations |
| Applicant:                | Scott Black, American Indian Health & Services                                                         |
| Agent:                    | Alicia Harrison, Brownstein Hyatt Farber Schreck, LLP                                                  |

(Listed on the Historic Resources Inventory, designed in 1953 by architects Reisner & Urbahn. Proposal for conversion of the existing 14,494-square-foot building to a new community health clinic on a 2.57-acre site located at the southeast corner of State Street and Las Positas Road. Proposal includes a 9,705-square-foot, two-story addition, 102 parking spaces, solar panel carports, landscaping, and public improvements. The project was designated a Community Benefit Project by the City Council on February 8, 2022. The HLC accepted the Historic Structures/Sites Report Phase 1 on November 9, 2022. Project requires Development Plan approval by the Planning Commission, and General Plan Amendment and Specific Plan approval by the City Council.)

**No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings and Major Alteration Findings would be required for a Project Design Approval.**

**Historic Structures/Sites Report Accepted in 2022\***

*\*Available for view online at [SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC)*

Actual time: 5:02 p.m.

Present: Michelle Lang, Architect, 19Six Architects; Sarah Corder, Architectural Historian, South Environmental; Ewa Pocwiardowska, Designer, 19Six; Sasha Shebalin, Landscape Architect, Arcadia Studio; and Kathleen Kennedy, Project Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 5:23 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Continue indefinitely with the following comments:**

1. In general, it is a very supportable project, and it is going in the right direction.
2. The Commission supports the overall site plan, mass, bulk, and scale as it is well organized, and it looks to function well as a pedestrian friendly clinic and site.
3. Carefully consider the materials palette. Consider minimizing the number and types of materials.
4. Landscaping is going in the right direction. Minimize any use of delicate species of plantings on a commercial project. Study expanding the Chumash garden throughout the site.
5. Study pulling the fence in the northwest corner three feet in from State Street.
6. The metal basket weave walls are going in the right direction.
7. Refine the stairs and the portion below the stairs.
8. Study the entry portico to be more tectonic with traditional supports from below as opposed to above.
9. In general, simplify the materials and types of treatments of openings.
10. Study the placement and screening of the emergency generator.
11. Study the screening for the solar structures, especially from the street view.
12. If original windows must be replaced, replace windows and match the existing to the greatest extent but with a new and functional material.
13. Study the roof detail as a metal cap or to match the historic cornice for the best solution.
14. Study the long window on east side of the State Street elevation and the mass at the corner.
15. Consider adding a portico element on the primary State St. entrance.

Action: Hausz/Ooley, 9/0/0. Motion carried.

**(4:00PM) CONTINUED ITEM: FINAL APPROVAL**

4. [1242 DOVER LN](#)  
Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-203-002  
Zone: RS-15  
Application Number: PLN2022-00411  
Owner: Margaret Phelps  
Applicant: Will Sofrin; Will Sofrin, Inc.

(Listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory, designed by Leonard Cooke in 1927 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style. Proposal for demolition of a 199-square-foot single-story addition, a 91-square-foot portion of the porch, and a 56-square-foot exterior staircase at the rear (south) of the residence, and a 154-square-foot covered porch addition at the western side of the residence; construction of a new 2,003-square-foot two-story addition (including basement) and a 211-square-foot extension to the porch (includes new staircase) at the rear of the residence; and a re-roof to replace the existing clay S-tile material with two-piece Mission tile throughout. The Commission previously accepted the Phase 1 and Phase 2 Historic Structures/Sites Report)

**Final Approval is requested. Project plans must demonstrate substantial conformance to the plans that received Project Design Approval on January 18, 2023. The project was last reviewed on January 18, 2023.**

**[Phase 1 Historic Structures/ Sites Report\\*](#)**

**[Revised Phase 2 Historic Structures/ Sites Report\\*](#)**

*\*Available for view online at [SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC](http://SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLC)*

Actual time: 6:00 p.m.

Present: Will Sofrin, Designer, Will Sofrin, Inc.;

Public comment opened at 6:08 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

**Motion: Final Approval with the following comments:**

1. Add lights to the Juliette balcony to match the pair below.
2. Add a note to detail 4 that the post is wrapped in plaster.
3. In detail 6, add a horizontal seam at the bottom of the corbel with a post supporting the bracket.
4. The drawings substantially conform to plans that were given Project Design Approval on January 18, 2023.

Action: Doordan/Ooley, 9/0/2. (Lenvik and McClure abstained.) Motion carried.

**(4:30PM) ONE-TIME PRE-APPLICATION REVIEW**

**5. [901 STATE ST](#)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-015

Zone: C-G

Application Number: PRE2023-00009

Owner: New Hospitality, LLC; Ray Mahboob, Managing Member

Applicant: Ed DeVicente, DMHA

(Located in El Pueblo Viejo Landmark District, Part I. Proposal for adaptive reuse of existing 2 story building with basement and mezzanine, and voluntary merger with adjacent lot for new egress stair; remove roof and replace with new two-level occupied roof with pool, spa, restrooms and bar; new stairs on adjacent parcel and two new elevators to access roof deck and basement; expansion of loading area along Canon Perdido. Site is in a 100% zone of benefit in the Central Business district and no parking is existing or proposed.)

**No final appealable action will take place at this meeting. Project Compatibility Findings would be required for a Project Design Approval.**

Actual time: 6:15 p.m.

Present: Ed DeVicente, Architect, DMHA; and Henry Lenny, Design Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio

Public comment opened at 6:28 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Commission comments:

- The Commission in general is very supportive of the project and appreciates the direction it is going in.
- Study the southwest portion of the building on the Canon Perdido elevation to be less streamline moderne style, and to be more Spanish Revival/Mediterranean styles per the EPV guidelines, including the windows and the eyebrow. Suggest studying the Reginald Johnson post office building.
- Study adding more plaster piers in the parapet wall with the suggestion of bringing the plaster to the first pilaster.
- The iron and glass canopy at the entry is too art nouveau in style. Restudy while understanding that the Commission is sensitive to approving iron and glass canopies.
- Adjust the moldings on the southwest portion of the elevator shaft.
- The column capitals on the pilasters on the Canon Perdido side should come down giving more space to the entablature. Add a base and/or plinth for the pilasters to sit on.
- The details will be very important to get right, but the overall direction is supportable.

**\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:51 P.M. \***